

**Internal distribution code:**

- (A) [ - ] Publication in OJ
- (B) [ - ] To Chairmen and Members
- (C) [ - ] To Chairmen
- (D) [ X ] No distribution

**Datasheet for the decision  
of 4 June 2019**

**Case Number:** T 1502/14 - 3.3.02

**Application Number:** 03784274.7

**Publication Number:** 1539711

**IPC:** C07D239/42

**Language of the proceedings:** EN

**Title of invention:**

PROCESS FOR PREPARING THE CALCIUM SALT OF ROSUVASTATIN

**Patent Proprietor:**

AstraZeneca UK Limited

**Opponents:**

Gillard, Richard Edward  
Teva Pharmaceutical Industries Ltd.

**Headword:**

**Relevant legal provisions:**

EPC Art. 113(2), 101

**Keyword:**

Basis of decision - text or agreement to text withdrawn by  
patent proprietor - patent revoked

**Decisions cited:**

T 0073/84, T 0655/11, T 0220/12, T 0381/12, T 2680/17

**Catchword:**



**Beschwerdekammern**  
**Boards of Appeal**  
**Chambres de recours**

Boards of Appeal of the  
European Patent Office  
Richard-Reitzner-Allee 8  
85540 Haar  
GERMANY  
Tel. +49 (0)89 2399-0  
Fax +49 (0)89 2399-4465

Case Number: T 1502/14 - 3.3.02

**D E C I S I O N**  
**of Technical Board of Appeal 3.3.02**  
**of 4 June 2019**

**Appellant:** Gillard, Richard Edward  
(Opponent 1) Elkington and Fife LLP  
Thavies Inn House  
3-4 Holborn Circus  
London EC1N 2HA (GB)

**Representative:** Elkington & Fife LLP  
Prospect House  
8 Pembroke Road  
Sevenoaks, Kent TN13 1XR (GB)

**Appellant:** Teva Pharmaceutical Industries Ltd.  
(Opponent 2) 5 Basel Street  
P.O. Box 3190  
49131 Petah Tiqva (IL)

**Representative:** D Young & Co LLP  
120 Holborn  
London EC1N 2DY (GB)

**Respondent:** AstraZeneca UK Limited  
(Patent Proprietor) 2 Kingdom Street  
London W2 6BD (GB)

**Representative:** Potter Clarkson  
The Belgrave Centre  
Talbot Street  
Nottingham NG1 5GG (GB)

**Decision under appeal:** **Decision of the Opposition Division of the  
European Patent Office posted on 10 June 2014  
rejecting the opposition filed against European  
patent No. 1539711 pursuant to Article 101(2)  
EPC.**

**Composition of the Board:**

<b>Chairman</b>	M. O. Müller
<b>Members:</b>	P. O'Sullivan
	L. Bühler

## **Summary of Facts and Submissions**

- I. By way of its decision, the opposition division found that European Patent No. 1 539 711 met the requirements of the European Patent Convention.
- II. The opponents (appellants) filed appeals against this decision requesting revocation of the patent.
- III. During oral proceedings before the board held on 4 June 2019, the respondent disapproved of the text of the granted patent and of all claim requests on file, stated that no amended text would be submitted, and that it expected the patent to be revoked.

## **Reasons for the Decision**

1. Under Article 113(2) EPC, the European Patent Office shall consider and decide upon the European patent only in the text submitted to it, or agreed, by the proprietor of the patent. This principle has to be observed also in opposition and opposition appeal proceedings.
2. The respondent, by withdrawing approval of the text of the granted patent, indicating that it would not be submitting an amended text and expecting the patent to be revoked, has thereby withdrawn its approval of any text for maintenance of the patent. Since the text of the patent is at the disposition of the patent proprietor, a patent cannot be maintained against the patent proprietor's will. There is therefore no text on the basis of which the Board can maintain the patent.

3. In view of the above, the Board concludes that the patent must be revoked as envisaged in Article 101 EPC and as expected by the respondent. This conclusion is also in line with established case law following decision T 73/84, OJ 1985, 241 (see e.g. T 655/11 of 11 November 2005; T 220/12 of 22 June 2015; T 381/12 of 3 January 2018; T 2680/17 of 2 April 2019).

## Order

### For these reasons it is decided that:

1. The decision under appeal is set aside.
2. The patent is revoked.

The Registrar:

The Chairman:



N. Maslin

M. O. Müller

Decision electronically authenticated